

# Environment Scrutiny Panel

## PUBLIC MEETING

### Record of Meeting

Date: 23<sup>rd</sup> January 2009

Meeting Number: 2

Present	Deputy P Rondel (Chairman) (PR) Connétable J Réfaut (JR) Deputy D Wimberley (DW)
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	M Haden, M Orbell

Ref Back	Agenda matter	Action
	<p><b>1. Records of Meetings</b> The minutes of the meeting of 17<sup>th</sup> December 2008 were approved and signed.</p>	<b>MO</b>
	<p><b>2. Matters Arising - Activity Report</b> The Panel noted an Activity Report prepared for the Chairman's Committee.</p>	
	<p><b>3. Panel Work Programme for 2009</b> Members identified the following priorities for the Panel's annual work programme :</p> <p>Transport and Technical Services</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ramsar – Impact of the Energy from Waste Plant</li> <li>• Liquid Waste Strategy</li> <li>• Integrated Travel And Transport Plan (ITTP)</li> <li>• (Possibly) Highways Maintenance; Sea Defences; Green Waste Policy</li> </ul> <p>Planning and Environment</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Environmental Taxes</li> <li>• Energy policy</li> <li>• Review of the Island Plan (it was considered that the most practical time for Scrutiny to look at this would be when it was scheduled for external inspection, prior to debate in the States)</li> </ul> <p>Based on the above it was anticipated that the Panel's work programme for 2009 could involve four major reviews and two or more smaller pieces of work.</p>	
	<p><b>4. Jersey's Ramsar Site: Impact of Energy from Waste Plant</b> Members agreed that this should be the first topic for review by the Panel. Draft topic assessment and scoping documents were agreed for submission to the Chairmen's Committee. It was decided that the Planning and Environment Department should be asked to confirm whether it had now written to the Ramsar Secretariat in respect of the planned new Energy from Waste Plant at La Collette. The Panel would then contact the Ramsar Secretariat directly to advise it of the proposed Scrutiny review and seek comments on the Environmental Impact Assessment process and the resulting Environmental Impact Statement produced by Babbie-Fichtner.</p>	<p><b>MH/MO</b></p> <p><b>MH/MO</b></p> <p><b>MH/MO</b></p>

	<p><b>5. Proposed Town Park/Ann Court Car Park</b> Members agreed to consider this matter for possible review following a briefing session which was to take place in private session (under Article 3.2.1(a) (xiv) of the Code of Practice on Public Access to Official Information) later in the current meeting.</p>	
	<p><b>6. Draft States Strategic Plan</b> Members agreed that it would be appropriate for the Panel to issue an invitation to local environmentalists to share their views on sustainable policies in the draft States Strategic Plan once this was published, possibly in April 2009.</p>	MH/MO
	<p><b>7. Topic Proposals</b> Members considered a number of topic proposals submitted by members of the public. Several items were found to be more appropriate to other Panels while some fell within wider topics already under consideration for review. Individual responses were agreed and officers were asked to write to contributors accordingly.</p>	MH/MO
	<p><b>8. Forthcoming Legislation - Draft Animal by Products Regulations</b> Members agreed that it would not be possible to make a meaningful response to the draft legislation before the date set for the end of the consultation period (31<sup>st</sup> January 2009). It was noted that the documentation was dated November 2008 but the previous Environment Panel had not acted upon it, possibly owing to time pressure because of election commitments. Officers were asked to enquire whether a consultation report would be forthcoming and to establish the timing proposed for introduction of the legislation by the Department.</p>	MH/MO
	<p><b>9. Ministerial Decisions</b> Recent Ministerial Decisions pertinent to the Panel's remit were noted.</p>	
	<p><b>10. Sustainable Development UK Conference, 19th March 2009</b> It was agreed that Deputy Wimberley would attend the above conference on behalf of the Panel and report back to members. It was noted that members would be in London the day before for the CPA visit so the only additional costs would be for one extra hotel night and the conference fee; given the relevance of the agenda this expenditure was felt to be justified.</p>	DW
	<p><b>11. Ends Report</b> - Journal for environmental policy and business in the UK Members decided against renewing the previous Environment Panel's annual subscription to this journal. It was felt that it would be more cost-effective for officers to research information relevant to specific reviews from other sources as and when required.</p>	MH/MO
	<p><b>12. Future Meetings</b> The Panel noted the schedule of meetings for 2009 with minor amendments to accommodate briefings from the TTS Department. The next scheduled meeting would start at 8.30am on 11<sup>th</sup> February 2009 in the 1st Floor Meeting Room, Morier House.</p>	MH/MO
	<p><b>13. Media Contacts</b> Further to discussion at the Chairmen's Committee, the Chairman requested that any members having particular contacts with media interests or specific talents for media contact generally should notify officers so that these could be put to good use to raise the Panel's media profile.</p>	PR/DW/JR
	<p><b>14. Geothermal Energy Presentation</b> Connétable Réfault reported back to the meeting on his attendance at a local presentation from Drill Academy (Thirsk) and Bauer</p>	

	<p>Maschinen GmbH regarding possibilities for obtaining geothermal energy from borehole drilling. It was explained that an invitation to the presentation had been received at short notice, precluding its inclusion on the published meeting agenda.</p>	
	<p><b>15. Energy Advice</b>  Further to a briefing meeting with the Minister for Planning and Environment on 22<sup>nd</sup> January 2009 in which he raised the subject of home insulation grants, members discussed the need for unbiased guidance for householders on the economics of different forms of home heating. It was felt that there could be a role for the Department in providing objective advice on the relative efficiency and costs of using electric, oil and gas-fired central heating systems, for example, as well as an indication of their environmental consequences. Experience showed that suppliers' claims were often confusing. There was a need for better advice to be made available not just on which systems were most economical and environmentally acceptable, but also on how to use them most efficiently.</p>	
	<p><b>16. Membership of Working Parties</b>  Members considered a further matter arising from the briefing meeting of 22<sup>nd</sup> January 2009 during which the Minister for Planning and Environment suggested that in discussions with the previous Environment Panel it had been proposed that a member of that Panel might be willing to sit on a working group set up by the Minister. He indicated that he was prepared to extend an invitation to the present Panel for a member to join the group looking at the Design of New Homes. Following discussion members agreed that such a move could make it very difficult for the member concerned to remain impartial, which might compromise the independence of the Panel and its ability to deliver effective Scrutiny; it was therefore decided to decline the invitation. Officers were asked to convey this decision to the Minister in a letter of response to the briefing.</p>	<p>MH/MO</p>
	<p><b>17. Proposed Town Park/Ann Court Car Park</b>  Following the private briefing session noted in Item 5 above, officers were asked to draft a response to the Minister for Transport and Technical Services highlighting several areas that the Panel considered would require further investigation before any car park development should proceed. Main points noted were the 'bad neighbour' effect during the demolition of existing properties and construction of the new car park and housing; concerns about increased airborne pollution from vehicle exhaust emissions once the car park is opened; and additional traffic and noise nuisance to residents of the area.</p>	<p>MH/MO</p>

Signed

Date:

  
.....

11.2.09  
.....

Chairman  
Environment Panel

